



Stakeholder Support “Proposal Writing”

GTI Greater Tumen Initiative

Documentation of the Implementation

Imprint

As a federally owned enterprise, we support the German Government in achieving its objectives in the field of international cooperation for sustainable development.

Published by:

Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

Registered offices

Bonn and Eschborn, Germany

T +49 228 44 60-0 (Bonn)

Friedrich-Ebert-Allee 40

53113 Bonn, Germany

T +49 228 44 60-0

F +49 228 44 60-17 66

Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1-5

65760 Eschborn, Germany

T +49 61 96 79-0

F +49 61 96 79-11 15

E info@giz.de

I www.giz.de

Name of the Programme

Support for Economic Cooperation in Sub-Regional Initiatives in Asia (SCSI)

Programme office

TaYuan Diplomatic Office

14 Liangmahe South Street, Chaoyang District

10600 Beijing, PR China

T +86-10-8532-5344

F +86-10-8532-5744

E scsi-asia@giz.de

Authors:

Gerelchimeg Chuluunbaatar-Trede (APPLICATIO), Thorsten Trede (APPLICATIO),

Items from named contributors do not necessarily reflect the views of the company/the editors.

Photo credits

APPLICATIO Training & Management GmbH

Ulaanbaatar, October 2021

Contents

1	The Greater Tumen Initiative (GTI)	5
1.1	GTI in General	5
1.2	GTI in Mongolia	6
1.3	Support to GTI by SRECA of GIZ	7
1.4	GTI Soft Projects	8
2	The Support Programme on Proposal Writing	10
2.1	Background	10
2.2	Objectives	10
2.3	Implementation of Webinars	10
2.3.1	Webinar Series A	10
2.3.2	Webinar Series B	11
2.3.3	Webinar Series C	12
2.4	Implementation of Coaching	12
2.4.1	Coaching A	13
2.4.2	Coaching B	13
2.4.2	Coaching C	14
2.5	Achievement of Objectives	14
3	Recommendations	15

Annexes

Annex 1: Series 1 Material (agenda, list of participants, handouts)

Annex 2: Series 2 Material (agenda, list of participants, handouts)

Annex 3: Series 3 Material (agenda, list of participants, handouts)

Abbreviations

ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
CC	Consultative Commission (of GTI)
Ch.	Chapter
FP	Focal Point(s)
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit GmbH
GTI	Greater Tumen Initiative
GTR	Greater Tumen Region
ISS	Institute for Strategic Studies
ISS	Institute for Strategic Studies
MGCA	Mongolian General Customs Authority
MGCA	Mongolian General Customs Authority
MNCCI	Mongolian National Chamber of Commerce and Industry
MoF	Ministry of Finance
MOFALI	Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Light Industry
MRTD	Ministry of Road and Transport Development of Mongolia
NEA	North-East Asia
PBG	Pan-Beibu Gulf (Regional Economic Cooperation)
PDR	People's Democratic Republic
PDR	People's Democratic Republic
PR	People's Republic
ROK	Republic of Korea
SCSI	Support or Economic Cooperation in Sub-Regional Initiatives in Asia
SRECA	Support of Regional Economic Cooperation
ToR	Terms of Reference
UNDAP	United Nations Development Programme

1 The Greater Tumen Initiative (GTI)

1.1 GTI in General

The Greater Tumen Initiative (GTI) (originally known as the Tumen River Area Development Programme) is an intergovernmental cooperation mechanism among four countries: China, Mongolia, Republic of Korea, and Russian Federation, supported by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP).

With its skilled and low-cost labour pool, the Greater Tumen Region possesses enormous potential for investment and economic growth. The Tumen River ties this region together at the crossroads of vital trade, transport, and energy routes. Rich in gas, oil and minerals, the region has easy access to affluent markets in NEA, representing millions of consumers. This potential can only be fully harnessed through dynamic cooperation among neighbours in the region.

In 1995, GTI member governments signed agreements to establish this mechanism, aimed at strengthening economic and technical cooperation, and attaining greater growth and sustainable development in NEA and specially the Greater Tumen Region. In particular, the GTI focuses on the priority areas of transport, trade and investment, tourism, agriculture, energy, with environment as a cross-cutting sector.

Committing to the vision of building a great partnership for common prosperity between neighbours, the GTI has become an effective platform for regional economic cooperation, expanding policy dialogue, improving business environments, and contributing to peace and stability in North-East Asia (NEA). In addition, the GTI works closely with important international partners to jointly promote the region, and hosts both the NEA EXIM Banks Association as a regional development financing mechanism, and the Local Cooperation Committee in support of cooperation initiatives among local governments in NEA.

The core decision-making institution of the GTI is the Consultative Commission (CC) which is composed of Vice-Ministers from the GTI member governments. The Commission's role is to foster support for regional cooperation and development and promote mutual understanding. It convenes annually to discuss key policy issues and cooperation projects among the GTI members and hosts joint sessions with strategic partners as well as local governments.

Today, the GTI continues to strengthen regional cooperation through policy dialogue and the implementation of priority projects. It has established strong partnerships with regional governments, international organizations, and the private sector to jointly promote cooperative activities in NEA. Increased regional cooperation has not only led to economic prosperity and sustainable development, but also significantly contributed to regional solidarity and stability.

GTI's vision is to build a great partnership for common prosperity between neighbours. GTI is committed to strengthening cooperation under the GTI framework to increase mutual benefit, accelerate

economic growth and promote sustainable development in Northeast Asia and in particular the Greater Tumen Region.

In accordance with the GTI Strategic Action Plan (2017-2020), GTI member countries share the following strategic objectives for the period 2017 to 2020:

- Promote the rehabilitation and construction of basic transportation infrastructure and major transportation hubs to support economic cooperation and development,
- Increase the effectiveness and the efficiency of the border-crossing procedures for the movement of goods and people,
- Promote agricultural cooperation for achieving sustainable agricultural development and ensure food security in the region,
- Create a positive environment to facilitate trade and attract private sector investment in the region, and improve access to international financial institutions for both public and private sector investment,
- Promote the GTR as a globally attractive tourist destination and increase the cross-border tourist flows in the NEA,
- Establish an effective institutional mechanism for energy policy cooperation and reduce non-physical barriers to energy trade,
- Promote environmental sustainability while conducting economic activities,
- Strengthen the EXIM banks cooperation and promote cooperation with other financial institutions in the region and beyond that aim to mobilize resources to finance bankable regional projects,
- Facilitate cooperation between research institutions,
- Strengthen the partnerships with Japan and DPRK and their participation in the GTI cooperation for common prosperity in NEA including joining the GTI framework institutions,
- Improve the GTI operational capabilities for implementation of the hard projects and coordination of the member-countries policies of regional and sectoral development including development of commercial services of the GTI,
- Develop the mechanism for establishing project office under the framework of the GTI and related platform for organisation of multilateral consultation process on issues and projects “of high importance”,
- Enhance the capacity of the GTI as a significant regional economic and political partnership in NEA including the efforts of legal transition and raise awareness of the GTI activities in the member-countries, and,
- Enhance the partnership with other international institutions.

1.2 GTI in Mongolia

GTI has four members: People’s Republic of China, Mongolia, Republic of Korea, and Russian Federation. GTI member governments have committed to strengthen economic cooperation and promote sustainable development and attaining greater growth and sustainable development in Northeast Asia, and specially the Greater Tumen Region, which covers the three Northeast provinces (Jilin,

Heilongjiang, & Liaoning) and Inner Mongolia of China, the Eastern Provinces of Mongolia, the Eastern port cities of the Republic of Korea, and the Primorsky Territory of the Russian Federation.

Mongolia is a founding member of GTI with the three Aimags (provinces) of Khentii, Dornod and Sukhbaatar - that form the Eastern Mongolian region - being involved in GTI.

This large (287,600 km²) but sparsely populated area is relatively less developed. This is one of the largest, yet undisturbed steppe ecosystems in the world and is the core habitat of the Mongolian gazelle. As such, tourism is promising, thanks to the area's pure natural beauty, cultural traditions, and festivals. Currently, agriculture and forestry account for 33% of the country's GDP, while transport and communications account for 10%, mining and quarrying (especially of copper, fluorspar, and molybdenum) for 9%, and manufacturing for 6%. Mongolia's radically changing and privatising economy means that the government is placing high priority on developing the country's natural resources processing sector and also on accessing regional transportation corridors.

As per organisational structure of GTI each country has nominated a National Coordinator for the initiative. While the Ministry of Finance of Mongolia takes on the role of the National Coordinator of the GTI in the country other ministries are engaged in the various boards and committees. Dornod, Khentii, Selenge and Sukhbaatar provinces are members of GTI Northeast Asia Local Cooperation Committee.

1.3 Support to GTI by SRECA of GIZ

The Support of Regional Economic Cooperation in Asia (SRECA) Programme, commissioned by the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) and implemented by the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH, works with Cambodia, Lao PDR, Mongolia, PR China and Viet Nam in the context of sub-regional cooperation initiatives such as the Pan-Beibu Gulf (PBG) Regional Economic Cooperation in Southeast Asia and the Greater Tumen Initiative (GTI) in Northeast Asia.

The objective of the programme is to strengthen and improve the quality of economic cooperation between selected focus countries – Cambodia, Lao PDR, and Viet Nam in the framework of ASEAN-China Cooperation, and Mongolia in the framework of GTI – and PR China, to ensure the equal inclusion of the countries' interests in regional integration processes in Asia.

The programme thereby operates in three areas:

- enhancing the structural conditions of regional economic cooperation,
- improving the implementation capabilities of the relevant stakeholders,
- fostering the inclusion of the private sector in relevant processes.

In these closely interlinked areas, the programme concentrates on trade facilitation tools of regional cooperation by providing assistance such as sector studies, capacity building measures, and facilitation of exchange mechanisms.

The GIZ Programme Support for Economic Cooperation in Sub-Regional Initiatives in Asia (SCSI) is supporting Mongolia's role in regional cooperation and integration since 2011. In 2016 the project organised the first dedicated workshop to enhance coordination and capacities to benefit from the GTI mechanism with the "Capacity Building Training on Proposal Writing for GTI Focal Points in Mongolia". At present, SCSI is still supporting Mongolia's inclusion in regional dialogues and cooperation under the GTI with one focus being on the development of applications for soft projects of GTI (see Ch. 1.4).

1.4 GTI Soft Projects

GTI supports members and organisations in member countries i.a. through so called "Soft-Projects". Project ideas for these soft projects (non-financing and non-infrastructure) can come from many sources, including the GTI Member States, provincial or local governments, private companies, NGOs, or the GTI Secretariat. However, given that the GTI is an intergovernmental cooperation mechanism, the right to bring up the project idea is only be given to the Member States (GTI National Coordinators, Board/Committee Members, local governments) and the GTI Secretariat.

A project idea should identify a specific problem and describe the ways and means of how to solve or ameliorate the situation. If the project idea meets the requirements for project ideas and justifies the need for GTI's support, the proponent member state(s) of the project or the GTI Secretariat will prepare a Project Proposal. The GTI Secretariat will submit the Project Proposals that meets the Requirements for Project Idea with its assessment note to the relevant GTI Sectoral Boards or Committees for its consideration.

During its regular meeting, the GTI Sectoral Boards/Committees will consider the Project Proposal by taking into account the

- requirements for Project Ideas,
- project's relevance and contribution to the respective GTI Sectoral Strategy and Action Plan,
- complementarity with regional and national policies and interventions, and
- the assessment made by the GTI Secretariat.

and will

- agree on the Project Proposal to be pursued under the GTI framework,
- refer the proposal back to the Member State preparing the Project Proposal to make specified amendments or reformulate the Project Proposal, or
- reject the Project Proposal.

As the number of soft projects Mongolia has applied for and the number of successfully applied projects from Mongolia is limited, SRECA and GIZ agreed to support Mongolian partners by planning and implementing a series of workshops on proposal writing and by supporting Mongolian applications with individual coaching for project proposal development. GIZ has contracted APPLICATIO Training & Management GmbH (www.applicatio.com Hamburg/Germany) to support the initiative.

2 The Support Programme on Proposal Writing

2.1 Background

Mongolia has been a member of Greater Tumen Initiative (GTI) since its inauguration in 2006. Mongolian focal points are the corner stone of Mongolia's cooperation under the GTI framework. Opportunities to use GTI Soft-Project Financing Mechanism remain underutilised so far.

Planning, preparation, and implementation of the projects are part of the work of the GTI Focal Points in Mongolia to enhance the regional inclusion of Mongolia into the GTI mechanism and issue Mongolian based projects. Here, GTI Focal Points lack capacity and skills. The main purpose of the support programme on "Project Proposals for the GTI Focal Points" in Mongolia was thus to enhance project planning and project management skills by helping participants to become better acquainted with tools and methods for project proposals writing and to use them in their approach to include Mongolia better into regional GTI processes.

The focus of the support programme was not only on imparting theoretical basics but also on the practical application of selected GTI Mongolian Focal Point projects. The support thus comprised of virtual training programmes (webinars) and individual coaching. In total three rounds of webinars and support coaching were implemented. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic the whole support programme was implemented virtually (and not following the initial Terms of Reference of the project).

2.2 Objectives

The original goal of the support programme was to enhance the skills and knowledge to develop, apply for and implement GTI soft projects and improve cooperation within Mongolia and with relevant partners under the GTI framework. It was in so far revised during the process as it was extended to also include applications to other funders/donors and not only the GTI soft project facility.

2.3 Implementation of Webinars

In total three rounds of webinars, followed by individual coaching (see Ch. 2.4) were implemented under the support programme as follows:

2.3.1 Webinar Series A

The first webinar series was implemented in May 2020 under the title of "Project Proposal Writing" for MGCA and Focal Points. It consisted of three webinars, namely:

- Webinar 1: "Project Planning Tools / LogFrame and its components (May 11, 2020)
- Webinar 2: Project Planning Tool / LogFrame and its usage (May 13, 2020)
- Webinar 3: Project Monitoring & Evaluation (May 20, 2020)

All webinars were implemented in English and Mongolian with consecutive interpretation by the trainer team, consisting of Gerelchimeg Chuluunbaatar-T. and Thorsten Trede with related training materials (presentation, case studies, examples, etc.) in Mongolian language (English is also available).

The 20 participants (selected and invited by GIZ) originated from:

- Mongolian General Customs Authority (MGCA)
- Institute for Strategic Studies (ISS)

The webinar series was evaluated very positive by participants with the only remark that internet connectivity was an issue from time to time and that possibly the duration was rather too short than too long for the content to be discussed. MGCA was highly committed and GIZ with MGCA organised the events very well. Participants were engaged and eager to learn in a (new) digital setting.

After the webinar, participants and their respective organisations were offered individual coaching for proposal development (see Ch. 2.4 for details).

2.3.2 Webinar Series B

The second webinar series was implemented in September 2020 (after coaching from the first round of participants had ended) under the title of “Logframe, M&E for Focal points”. It consisted of three elements, namely:

- Webinar 1: “Logframe and its Components” (Sept. 16, 2020)
- Homework “Logframe Development” (Sept. 17-23, 2020)
- Webinar 2 “Logframe and its Usage” (Sept. 24, 2020)

All webinars were implemented in English and Mongolian with consecutive interpretation by the trainer team, consisting of Gerelchimeg Chuluunbaatar-T. and Thorsten Trede with related training materials (presentation, case studies, examples, etc.) in Mongolian language (English is also available).

The 17 participants (selected and invited by GIZ) originated from:

- Ministry for Road, Transport Development
- Dornod Governor’s Office
- Mongolian National Chamber of Commerce and Industry (MNCCI)

The webinar series was evaluated very positive by participants. Esp. the inclusion of a self-learning phase with homework to make use of what has been learned during the first webinar and the discussion of the results of this homework in webinar 3 attracted participants.

After the webinar, participants and their respective organisations were offered individual coaching for proposal development (see Ch. 2.4 for details).

2.3.3 Webinar Series C

The third webinar series was implemented in March and April 2021 (after coaching of the Second round of participants had ended) under the title of “Proposal Writing for Focal Points and MNCCI Branches”. It was divided into two parallel groups of participants and thus consisted of the following elements:

- Online training 1 on “Problem Analysis” for Focal Points (March 17, 2021)
- Online training 2 on “Problem Analysis” for MNCCI Branches (March 18, 2021)
- Online training 3 on “Stakeholder Analysis” for Focal Points (March 24, 2021)
- Online training 4 on “Stakeholder Analysis” for MNCCI Branches (March 25, 2021)
- Online training 5 on “GTI Proposal & Logframe” for Focal Points (March 31, 2021)
- Online training 6 on “GTI Proposal & Logframe” for MNCCI Branches (April 1, 2021)
- Online training 7 on “PM incl. M&E” for Focal Points (April 7, 2021)
- Online training 8 on “PM incl. M&E” for MNCCI Branches (April 8, 2021)

All webinars were implemented in English and Mongolian with consecutive interpretation by the trainer team, consisting of Gerelchimeg Chuluunbaatar-T. and Thorsten Trede with related training materials (presentation, case studies, examples, etc.) in Mongolian language (English is also available). The webinar series was adapted to the results of the previous webinars and thus extended in time and topic-wise.

The 127 participants (selected and invited by GIZ) originated from:

- Development Bank of Mongolia
- Institute for Strategic Studies
- Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Light Industry
- Ministry for Road, Transport Development
- Sukhbaatar Province Governor Office
- Mongolian General Custom Authority
- MNCCI central office and 20 CCI province branches

The webinar series was evaluated very positive by participants. Esp. the start of the webinar with “problem and stakeholder analysis” which then lead to “project planning and proposal development”, ending with M&E was taken up very positively.

After the webinar, participants and their respective organisations were offered individual coaching for proposal development (see Ch. 2.4 for details).

2.4 Implementation of Coaching

The coaching was originally planned as “just an additional” support to participants but during implementation became more and more important until in the end the webinars were rather to be regarded

as a preparation for the coaching which was expected to end in a project application ready for submission. The coaching thus aimed at assisting participants in practically developing project proposals. Participants were thus encouraged to submit drafts of proposals to receive advice and feedback from the facilitators by e-mail. In addition a high number of live online meetings and consultations were implemented with the various partners on their project proposals.

2.4.1 Coaching A

The first “round of coaching” was implemented for participants of the webinar series A between May 25 and June 30, 2020. It total six teams with differing proposal ideas and project needs were coached as follows:

- MGCA -Setting of GTI Custom Single E-Window
- MGCA – Setting of GTI pre-arrival information exchange
- MGCA – Cooperation of GTI Board Control Agencies
- MGCA – Energy (solar&wind) hybrid system at Border Stations
- ISS – Analysis of the economic advantage of GTI countries using System dynamic analysis
- MNCCI – E-Commerce in GTR
- MOFALI – Organic Agroindustry Asia Forum

At the end of Coaching A total of 7 Logframes, 5 proposals, one draft proposal were developed by the participants with the support of the consultants (e-mail support, webinars, short virtual meetings, further development of proposals). For further information on proposal developed, please refer to Ch. 2.5.

2.4.2 Coaching B

The second “round of coaching” was implemented for participants of the webinar series B between September 25 and November 15, 2020. It total three teams with differing proposal ideas and project needs were coached as follows:

- LG Dornod – Improving Cross–border Movement in GTR
- MNCCI – Capacity Building Aquaponic
- MRTD – GTI Integration Study East Railway

In order to further motivate participants a “mini-competition” was added as additional element to the coaching with participating teams being rewarded for participation, timely submission of drafts, and submission of proposals, etc. Winners of the mini-competition on proposal writing (Duration: 25 Sept. 30 Nov.2020) were:

- Dornod LG team within proposal “Regulation of GTI Cross-Border Employment”
- MRTD Team within proposal “Study on Integration of East-Vertical Railway to GTI Network”

The prizes awarded consisted of a final dinner for team members to “celebrate” proposal development and team building.

At the end of the coaching phase B a total of 3 proposals incl. Logframes were developed of which one was submitted. For further information on proposals developed, please refer to Ch. 2.5.

2.4.2 Coaching C

The last “round of coaching” was implemented for participants of the webinar series B between April 15 and October 15, 2021. It total five teams with differing proposal ideas and project needs were coached as follows:

- CCI Bayankhongor – Capacity Building on Green House in Khangai Region
- CCI Bayan-Ulgie – Promotion of Green Energy in Western Region
- CCI Khentii – Health Service Centre for Vulnerable Population
- Sukhbaatar CCI – Capacity Building on Export Meat
- MNCCI - Support Centre for Women-led Businesses

At the end of the coaching phase C a total of 3 proposals and 5 Logframes were developed of which two were submitted. For further information on proposals developed, please refer to Ch. 2.5.

2.5 Achievement of Objectives

The facilitators are of the opinion that the support programme met its objectives. The objective was defined as follows:

Enhance the skills and knowledge to develop, apply for and implement GTI Soft Projects (and other donor projects) and improve cooperation within Mongolia and with relevant partners under the GTI framework.

The fact that proposals and even more Logframes were developed and that proposals were submitted indicates that participants have all necessary skills to analyse situations, develop projects out of problem statements, write project proposals and submit these. In total 161 participants were capacitated in webinars and in addition many other participants that were included in the coaching (by the organisations) gained additional skills in addition.

In addition, 15 project teams from ten institutions (5 Focal Points) were coached and 15 project Logframes were developed out of which 13 proposals were drafted and 10 full project proposals were developed according to GTI soft-project facility guidelines of which three have already been submitted to GTI:

Coaching 1 on Proposal Writing 25 May – 30 July 2020						
	Proposals	Focal Points	Year	Focus	Partner Countries	Ouputs
Coaching 1						
1	GTI E-Commerce	MNCCI	01.06.2020-01.06.2021 (12 months)	Pre-condition of e-commerce in cross-border trade in GTR (public awareness, legal framework, capacity building)	1. Republic of Korea 2. Republic of China	Proposal incl. logframe
2	Organic Agriculture Asia	MOFALI	1-6 June, 2020	Capacity building on organic agro-industry (Organic agro-industry conference and training-o-trainers Asia)	1. People's Republic of China 2. Republic of Korea 3. Russian Federation 4. Japan	Proposal incl. logframe
3	GTI Trade E-Window	MCGA	2020-2021	Development and Piloting of Trade E-Window System in GTR (Custom e-Clarification)	1. People's Republic of China 2. Republic of Korea 3. Russian Federation	Proposal incl. logframe
4	GTI Pre -arrival Information Exchange	MCGA	30.09.2020-30.12.2021	Development and Piloting of E-Exchange System of Custom Pre-Arrival information in GTR	1. People's Republic of China 2. Republic of Korea 3. Russian Federation	Proposal incl. logframe
5	Survey on GTI Economic Advantage	ISS	10.2020-08.2021	Analysis of GTI Economic Advantages Using System Dynamic Methodology.	1. People's Republic of China 2. Republic of Korea 3. Russian Federation	Proposal incl. logframe
6	Cooperation of GTI Boarder Control Agencies	MCGA	2020-2021	Improving of effective efficient structure of GTI joint border controlling and modernisation	1. People's Republic of China 2. Republic of Korea 3. Russian Federation	Logframe and proposal draft exist
7	(solar & wind) Energy hybrid system at border station	MCGA	-	Feasibility study on hybrid power system at border stations, fund rising, and implementation	-	Logframe developed
Coaching 2						
8	Improving cross-border labour movement in GTR	Dornod LG	1.2021-6.2022	GTI regulation on cross- border employment, regional research, and forum on cross border employment	1. People's Republic of China 2. Republic of Korea 3. Russian Federation	Proposal incl. logframe

Coaching 1 on Proposal Writing 25 May – 30 July 2020						
	Proposals	Focal Points	Year	Focus	Partner Countries	Ouputs
9	Study on East Railway Integration to GTI Railway Network	MRTD	1.2021-9.2021	Study of a new potential railway route in the Great Tumen region	1. People's Republic of China 2. Russian Federation	Proposal incl. logframe
10	Capacity Building on Aquaponic Greenhouse farming in GTI region	MNCCI	-	Setting of aquaponic competence centre incl. Curricula, material development, capacity building, setting of facilities	1. People's Republic of China 2. Republic of Korea 3. Russian Federation	Logframe and proposal draft exist
Coaching 3						
11	Capacity Building on Green House	Bayankhongor CCI	8.2021- 12.2022	Setting of training base on greenhouse incl. Development and piloting of Training offers, internship programme, and model green house	1. People's Republic of China 2.	GTI Proposal incl. logframe JAIMKA proposal
12	Promotion on Green Energy in Western Region	Bayan-Ulgie CCI	-	Improving of knowledge and information on green energy, developing a bonus system for green energy usage, promoting green PPP in the energy sector	1. People's Republic of China 2. Republic of Korea 3. Russian Federation	Logframe developed
13	Health service for vulnerable population	CCI Khentii	8.2021-3.2022	Setting of health service point incl. training, coaching and treatment offers for disabled people	-	Logframe
14	Capacity Building on Export Meat Quality in Eastern region	Sukhbaatar CCI	11.2021-11.2022	Export readiness, QM programme incl. training and consulting, capacity building on meat branding and technology for 22 meat factories in the region	1) People's Republic of China 2) Russian Federation	Proposal incl. logframe
15	Women-led Business Support Centre	MNCCI	5.2022-2.2024	Developing tailor -made service offers, advocacy and networking of Women-led businesses in GTI region	1) People's Republic of China 2) Republic of Korea 3) Russian Federation	Logframe and proposal draft exist

3 Recommendations

Recommendations as a result of the support programme been developed by the facilitators based on their impressions during and after the webinars and coaching. These include:

- **General / Soft-Project Facility**

- For a full project application (GTI), a template exists that can be used by participants and that fully allows a transparent assessment by the several assessors included in the process. At the same time, there is no such template for a project idea (which will have to be handed in first and will also be assessed). The overall process thus remains a bit unclear, and it is proposed to develop a template for project ideas (which can be based on the proposal template).

Recommendation: Discuss and possibly adapt the GTI Soft-Project Facilities Guidelines and application forms and processes with the GTI secretariat and focal points.

- The Soft-Project “Facility” is not fully competitive with other donor-based options to apply for project funding. As a result of the full project application cycle of GTI, the secretariat will assist applicants in securing funding, while funding is the direct end result of competing facilities, where a successful application ends in direct funding. It is thus recommended to either make this clearer in the guidelines or to possibly adapt the use of internal funding sources.

Recommendation: Discuss and possibly adapt the GTI Soft-Project Facilities Guidelines and financing options or create more transparency about final application outcomes and application procedures (incl. defining annual deadlines).

- Responsible experts in the partner organisations change constantly. At the same time there is hardly any organisational learning within the partners in place. This leads to a situation, where not only proposal writing but even GTI as a whole has to be introduced to participants on an almost annual basis. It is thus recommended to create more responsibility within partner organisations to ensure organisational learning, when handing over to new experts.

- The implementation of the support programme has shown that often the identification of partners and joint proposal development between at least two partners (cross-border; as per GTI guidelines for soft-projects) is a challenge and sometime not regarded as important as it should be by partners. One factor might be, that potential partners do not know enough about ideas, needs and initiatives of other partners across borders and that this projects are developed in silos.

Recommendation: Develop a web-platform in which partners can propose their project ideas (in shortest form) or problem analysis to allow for matchmaking between initiatives before a project proposal is developed. In addition, regular (virtual) project idea market-places and pitches could be implemented to allow for matchmaking and partnering involving all potential applicants (and not only high level such as in steering groups or working groups).

- **Support Programme**

- Implementation in a virtual format has worked very well and no loss in effectiveness and efficiency can be seen. In contrary, especially the coaching phase can be implemented better in a virtual setting as it allows for more flexibility in the support and timing. As for the webinars, face-to-face workshops (at least one at the beginning) would still be recommendable in order to create more trust and a more personal relationship.

- MS-Teams a tool has proven very useful, although participants never use the fully functionality (joint work on document, document sharing, chat, etc.) but rather only the video conferencing functions.

- As the support programme cannot develop project ideas for participants, it has proven useful to ask participating organisations already during their application for participation for a project idea and possibly a donor to attract (to allow for related application planning in coaching and related examples in webinars).

Recommendation: Fully ensure that participants / organisations apply with a project idea to work on; participants without a project idea could participate in the webinars as a general training on proposal writing but should not be included in coaching.

- All three rounds of webinars and the connected coaching have shown that there is a larger turnover in participants esp. between webinars and coaching. This often created a need to train “newcomers” during the coaching again from the very beginning subject-matter wise, while training investment into training in webinars was slightly lost in cases that the webinar participants were not made part of the coaching team.

Recommendation: Ensure that webinar participants are also part of the coaching team as far as possible.

In all three rounds of the support programme, partners were highly committed. Esp. mentioned should be :

- Dr. D. Tsendsuren (MGCA, Senior Custom officer)
- Mrs Ch. Tsetsegmaa (ISS, Executive Sector for Economic Research)
- Mrs B. Enkh-Ulzie (MRTD, Officer in charge of railway project and programme)
- Mrs O. Baigalmaa (LG -Dornod, Head of Labour and Social Care Service Division)
- Mrs S. Oyunzul (MNCCI, Head of Project and Programme Department)
- Mr. L. Enkhbayar (CCI Bayan-Khongor, manager)
- Mrs E. Batzaya (Sukhbaatar CCI, manager)

None of the trainings (starting with the selection of participants, logistical support, invitation, communication, and motivation) would have been successful without committed partners and esp. Ms S. Zolzaya of GIZ in Ulaanbaatar

Should GIZ plan for additional support, the fooling is practically recommended:

- Consulting to adapt GTI Soft-Project Proposal Guidelines and development of “Project Idea Template”.
- Webinar series as per webinar series C of this support programme, consisting of:
 - “Problem Analysis”
 - “Stakeholder Analysis”
 - “Proposal & Logframe
 - “Project Management incl. M&E”
 - Possibly in addition “Financial Project Planning (finance and resource planning).
- If the COVID-19 situation allows for it, the first workshop (e.g., on topic 1, 2 and 3) should be implemented face-to-face, while the others and coaching can be implemented virtually.
- Inclusion of GTI secretariat into first webinar/workshop to create transparency about project proposal.
- Possibly collection of calls for proposals, donor-schemes, etc. as basis for proposal development; in ideal case implementation of a virtual conference with donors introducing their schemes to participants (to select from).
- Application of participating focal points and organisation as team of people with a clear project idea (possibly based on “Project Idea Template” that does not exist so far.
- Ensuring that participants fully participate and do not change so that organisations ensure organisational learning of team members change.

Annexes

Annex 1:

Series 1 Material (agenda, list of participants, handouts)

(to be found online at: <https://cloud.applicatio.com/index.php/s/HWAtF9c3J5w4gT6>)

Annex 2:

Series 2 Material (agenda, list of participants, handouts)

(to be found online at: <https://cloud.applicatio.com/index.php/s/HWAtF9c3J5w4gT6>)

Annex 3:

Series 3 Material (agenda, list of participants, handouts)

(to be found online at: <https://cloud.applicatio.com/index.php/s/HWAtF9c3J5w4gT6>)

Registered offices

Bonn and Eschborn, Germany
T +49 228 44 60-0 (Bonn)
T +49 61 96 79-0 (Eschborn)

Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1-5
65760 Eschborn, Germany
T +49 61 96 79-0
F +49 61 96 79-11 15

E info@giz.de
I www.giz.de

Support for Economic Cooperation in Sub-Regional Initiatives in Asia

TaYuan Diplomatic Office
14 Liangmahe South Street, Chaoyang District
100600 Beijing, PR China

E scsi-asia@giz.de